"BRETT COULDN'T HOLD HIM": LADY ASHLEY, PEDRO ROMERO, AND THE MADRID SEQUENCE OF *THE SUN ALSO RISES*

DONALD A. DAIKER
Miami University

THE CENTRAL EVENT IN Ernest Hemingway's *The Sun Also Rises* occurs when the novel's narrator and protagonist, Jake Barnes, arranges for the woman he loves but cannot have, Lady Brett Ashley, to begin a sexual liaison with the young Spanish bullfighter Pedro Romero. Jake's decision to bring Brett to Romero has both immediate and future consequences. Its immediate result is that Robert Cohn, desperately in love with Brett himself, calls Jake a "damned pimp" (*SAR* 194).[1] When Jake responds by swinging at him, Cohn knocks Jake out cold and then goes on to pummel Mike Campbell, Brett's fiancé. Cohn next attacks Romero. "He nearly killed the poor, bloody bull-fighter" (205), Mike tells Jake. But although Cohn knocks Romero down "about fifteen times," the bullfighter, unlike Jake and Mike, will not stay down:

> . . . . he wanted to fight some more. Brett held him and wouldn't let him get up. He was weak, but Brett couldn't hold him, and he got up. (206)

The longer range consequences of Jake's pandering include Mike's increased drunkenness, Cohn's tearful apology and departure from Pamplona, Jake's becoming so depressed that he gets drunker than ever before, and—most significantly—Brett's going off to Madrid with Romero.

Virtually every reader of *The Sun Also Rises* would, I believe, accept the accuracy of the above summary. Disagreement arises about what happens

THE HEMINGWAY REVIEW, VOL. 29, NO. 1, FALL 2009. Published by the University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho.

next in the novel. What happens, that is, between Brett and Romero once they reach Madrid? We know that they stay together in the Hotel Montana, and we know that they are there for no more than three days and nights.[2] By the time Jake arrives at Brett's hotel—less than four full days after she and Romero have left Pamplona—Romero is gone and gone for good. Most readers of *The Sun Also Rises* are convinced—mistakenly, I believe—that Romero is gone because Brett has sent him away. Many commentators believe not only that Brett ends the relationship but that her sending Romero away is her most moral and commendable act in the novel. Stanley Edgar Hyman writes that "the key action of the book is Brett's renunciation of Romero for the boy's own good, the first truly unselfish act in her life" (31). "In giving up Romero," Frederic Joseph Svoboda writes, "Brett has acted more responsibly than we have seen before" (27). Linda Patterson Miller describes Brett's sending Romero away as "her personal breakthrough" (179). For Milton A. Cohen it is "her first brave act in the story, the first in which she renounces her sexual magic and debasing power" (303). Robert W. Lewis writes that Brett "selflessly drives him [Romero] away" (75), and Gerry Brenner finds in Brett's behavior evidence of "genuine moral growth" (50). There seems to be critical consensus, then, on what Earl Rovit calls "Brett's famous act of self-abnegation, her decision to send Romero away because she will not be 'one of these bitches that ruins children'" (155).

But even among those who agree that Brett rather than Romero has ended the affair, there is growing recognition of the complexity of Brett's character. For Lawrence Broer, Brett is not only "Hemingway's most complex and provocative female character" but "one of the most elusive and richly enigmatic figures in modern literature" (139). Linda Patterson Miller argues that critics have ignored "the complexity of Brett's character and the intricate role she plays in the novel . . ." ("Brett Ashley" 170). Delbert Wylder points to "the subtlety with which Hemingway treats some of the deeper aspects of Jake's and Brett's rather complicated relationship, and particularly the characterization of Lady Brett Ashley" (90). A major reason why Brett is both elusive and enigmatic, why in Miller's words she "resists formulaic readings" ("In Love with Papa" 10), is, as Jackson J. Benson explains, that "Hemingway treats her with a delicate balance of sympathy and antipathy" (36). So while understanding Brett and her complex motivations will not be easy, a close, analytic reading of the Madrid sequence will show that it is Romero who has left Brett and not the other way around.

What we know about Brett and Romero in Madrid we know directly only from Brett herself. Because Romero is gone and never heard from again, we learn about their short time together only from what Brett reveals to Jake during their conversations—first in her room at the Hotel Montana, next at the bar of the Palace hotel, then at Botín's restaurant, and finally during a taxi ride along Madrid's Gran Via. But how we understand and interpret Brett's words—and whether we find her story credible—will be colored by her behavior, especially her body language, by Jake's responses to what Brett is telling and showing him, and by our judgment of her trustworthiness as a narrator.

Although there may be no earlier instances in the novel of Brett's outright dishonesty, she often makes statements that are simply not true. She fibs when she tells Cohn that she's promised the next dance to Jake and then that she and Jake have a date in Montmartre (*SAR* 30). Then, to convince Jake to leave the *bal musette* with her, Brett tells him that Georgette, the woman he brought there, is "well taken care of" (31). Brett is wrong: soon after Jake and Brett leave, Georgette becomes involved in a "frightful row" with the patronne's daughter (36). Brett is equally mistaken, but with far graver consequences, when she tells Jake that she thought her going off with Robert Cohn would be "good for him" (89). Brett is wrong again when she tells Jake that "Michael and I understand each other" (148), implying that Mike understands and accepts her affair with Cohn when actually Brett's infidelities—first with Cohn and then with Romero—destroy Mike emotionally. But what Brett tells Jake in Madrid is not simply wrong or mistaken; what Brett says about her relationship to Romero is a lie. Brett knows it is a lie, and it does not take long for Jake to realize it is a lie, although he never lets on that he knows. Brett tells Jake that she ended the relationship with Romero when her words, her actions, and Jake's responses show that it was in fact Romero who left.

In Madrid, as earlier in Pamplona, "Brett couldn't hold him" (*SAR* 206). Clearly, the primary meaning here of "Brett couldn't hold him" is that Brett does not have the physical strength to hold Romero *down*, to prevent him from getting up off the floor to continue fighting with Cohn. But an equally clear secondary meaning is that Brett is unable to hold *on to* Romero, to prevent him from eventually leaving her. This latter meaning dominates *The Torrents of Spring*, the parody Hemingway wrote and published while he was writing and revising *The Sun Also Rises*. In *Torrents*, Hemingway uses the phrase "hold him" no fewer than 29 times to charac-

terize the relationship between Scripps O'Neil, the story's protagonist, and his elderly wife Diana. "He was her man and she would hold him" (*TOS* 43), Diana vows; "That was all that mattered now. To hold him. To hold him. Not to let him go. Make him stay" (42). But by the end of the book Scripps has left: "She couldn't hold him. She couldn't hold him. She couldn't hold him" (82).

When Jake arrives at Brett's hotel room, it is immediately clear that she is in desperate straits. Brett's desperation was signaled earlier by her having sent Jake not one but two identically worded telegrams: "COULD YOU COME HOTEL MONTANA MADRID AM RATHER IN TROUBLE BRETT (*SAR* 243)." Brett's use of the word "rather" underlines her desperation because, in her British idiom, "rather" does not have the American meaning of "to a certain extent" or "somewhat." Both the Oxford English Dictionary and the *American Heritage Dictionary* point to the chiefly British usage of "rather" as an intensive, as an emphatic affirmative, and that is how Brett has used the word earlier in the novel. When Jake says that Brett knows where to find drinks in his apartment, Brett answers, "Rather" (61), meaning "certainly" or "absolutely." When Brett is asked whether Romero will fight after his beating by Cohn, she responds, "Rather" (210), meaning he assuredly will. Thus when Brett describes herself as "rather in trouble," she is telling Jake that she is in deep and even debilitating difficulty.

Jake's understanding that Brett is deeply distressed is confirmed as soon as he reaches the Hotel Montana. There the maid says that Brett wants to see him "now, at once," and moments later Brett calls out, "Come in. Come in" (*SAR* 245), the repetition in each instance signaling how desperately she needs Jake. As soon as Jake enters, Brett exclaims "Darling!" in obvious tones of relief and, apparently with her eyes and body language, invites Jake to her bed to comfort her with an embrace. Jake immediately notices that Brett's hotel room is "in that disorder produced only by those who have always had servants" (245), an indication that Jake has started to understand his subservient role in Brett's life, at least as Brett sees it. Brett's characteristic response to the messes she creates is to leave them for others to clean up. She flicks cigarette ashes on the rug in Jake's Paris apartment until Jake finds "some ash-trays and spread them around" (64). When her dalliance with Romero so angers Mike that he deliberately upsets a café table, crashing beer and shrimp to the ground, Brett says, "Let's get out of this" (211) and leaves. Throughout *The Sun Also Rises*, the conditions of rooms consistently correspond to the emotional states of their occupants.

Mike's room at the Hotel Montoya is "in great disorder" with bags open, clothing "strewn around," and "empty bottles beside the bed" (214). By contrast, because Jake is trying to put his post-fiesta life back together, his room in San Sebastian is tidy and orderly with bags unpacked, clothes hung up, and books stacked neatly on a bedside table (238). Brett's disordered room points to her disordered life and psyche now that Romero has left her.

Brett will not admit to Jake that Romero has walked out on her. And because, as Delbert Wylder has observed, "Brett does not understand herself very well" (93), she initially may not even admit it to herself. Because no other male in the novel has yet resisted Brett's beauty and charm, Romero's may have been her first such rejection. But in response to questions, Brett provides enough information to enable Jake to figure things out. Although at first Brett says, "I made him [Romero] go," her subsequent disclosures suggest that Romero left on his own. Brett's first painful admission occurs when she acknowledges that "It was rather [absolutely, totally] a knock his being ashamed of me. He was ashamed of me for a while, you know" (*SAR* 246). Apparently Romero grew ashamed of Brett's short hair—she wears it "brushed back like a boy's" (30)—and wanted her to grow it out in order to look "more womanly" (246). Brett goes on to tell Jake that Romero "got over that. He wasn't ashamed of me long" (246). But she later undermines her assertion when she says of Romero, "he'd have gotten used to" her personal appearance. (247). Her use of the conditional *would* strongly implies that Romero had not gotten over being ashamed of her by the time he leaves. And if Romero "really wanted" to marry her, as Brett claims, that marriage could only occur, Brett acknowledges, "After I'd gotten more womanly" (246), something that will never occur. When Jake asks, "What was it about being in trouble?", Brett answers, "I didn't know whether I could make him go" (246). Her language—especially the conditional *could*—makes clear that she never had the chance to ask Romero to go because he left on his own. Even so, in an attempt to prevent Jake from grasping the truth of her situation, she quickly changes the subject from "trouble" to "money."

There are other good reasons besides the inconsistencies in Brett's story, to believe that Romero has dumped her. Brett's acute depression seems unaccountable if she has been the one to end the relationship. Brett has been upset before—"Oh, darling, I've been so miserable," she told Jake in Paris (*SAR* 32)—but that is nothing compared to her deep despair in

Madrid. Not only does she admit she's "had such a hell of a time" (245), but Brett is "trembling" and "crying," something that didn't happen earlier (245, 247). Jake goes on to say, "I could feel her crying. Shaking and crying" (247). Moments later Jake can still feel Brett "crying," and even after he comforts her by stroking her hair, she is still "shaking" (247). Only after the first sip of a Martini is Brett's hand steady enough to lift her glass (248).

Hemingway suggests in two further ways that Brett's crying, shaking, and general depression is the result of Romero's decision to leave her. The first sign is Brett's refusal to look at Jake. As long as the two remain in the hotel room where she and Romero have lived together, Brett will not look into Jake's eyes. Elsewhere in *The Sun Also Rises* and in other work by Hemingway, an inability to look directly at someone is a sign of dishonesty, deception, or an unwillingness to accept painful truth. In "The End of Something," the story of Nick Adams's breakup with his girl friend Marjorie, Nick is "afraid to look at Marjorie" because he does not want to tell her that he doesn't love her any more (*CSS* 81). When Nick eventually does tell her, he still cannot look at her face, only at her back. This link between looking away and deception or denial continues in *The Sun Also Rises*. When the innkeeper at Burguete announces outrageously high room rates to Jake, she "put her hands under her apron and looked away from me"; when Jake protests, she "just took off her glasses and wiped them on her apron" (*SAR* 115). When Jake and Brett are alone in his Paris apartment, Jake lies "face down on the bed" because he refuses to acknowledge that he and Brett cannot live together (61). To emphasize this point, Jake repeats it: "I was lying with my face away from her. I did not want to see her" (62). When Cohn, rejected by Brett, lies "face down, on the bed in the dark" (197), looking away again constitutes a reluctance to acknowledge unpleasant truth. Moments later Cohn is still "face down on the bed, crying" (197). Brett's looking away from Jake in Madrid is both a sign that she does not want to face up to rejection and an indication that she does not believe the story she is telling Jake. Significantly, just after Brett tells Jake that sending Romero away makes her "feel rather good" and "rather set up" (247), she cannot look Jake in the eye. At this precise point in her story, Brett "looked away" and "wouldn't look up." Moments later she still "would not look up" (247). Brett refuses to admit that Romero has abandoned her, but Jake—having been in her position earlier—puts his arms around her, holds her close, and gently strokes her hair in acknowledgment of her need to deny the truth of Romero's rejection.

The credibility of Brett's assertion that she made Romero leave is further undercut by her lack of self-control during the Madrid sequence.[3] One sign is her constant swearing. Brett resorts to profanity no less than ten times in four pages, whereas Jake swears only once at the very beginning of the scene. In *The Sun Also Rises*, profanity is often a sign of anger, pain, or distress. For example, when Bill asks about Brett, Jake admits that he has been in love with her "Off and on for a hell of a long time," but that he doesn't "give a damn any more" although he'd "a hell of a lot rather not talk about it" (*SAR* 128). Jake's swearing is also a sign of anger when he says, "[W]hat the hell is it to Frances?" (14), "To hell with you, Brett Ashley (152)," "Oh, to hell with Cohn" (226), and, on receiving Brett's telegrams, "Well, that meant San Sebastian all shot to hell" (243). Significantly, Hemingway eliminated the profanity from the novel's original last line—"'Yes,' I said. "'It's nice as hell to think so'"—because he did not want to imply a loss of control on Jake's part (*SAR: Facsimile* 616). Hemingway considered the use of profanity essential to his novel. When his Scribner's editor Maxwell Perkins asked him to eliminate some of the profanity, Hemingway resisted fiercely—but with a touch of humor: "I've tried to reduce profanity but I reduced so much profanity when writing the book that I'm afraid not much could come out. Perhaps we will have to consider it simply as a profane book and hope that the next book will be less profane or perhaps more sacred" (*SL* 213).

Brett's inability to stop talking about Romero is a further sign of her loss of control. Again and again, Brett begs Jake to drop the topic of her relationship to the bullfighter:

> "Oh, hell!" she said, "let's not talk about it. Let's never talk about it." (*SAR* 245)
>
> "Oh, let's not talk about it." (246)
>
> "Don't let's ever talk about it. Please don't let's ever talk about it." (247) ."But, oh, Jake, please let's never talk about it." (247)

When Brett herself insists on bringing up Romero after each such plea, Jake finally says, "I thought you weren't going to ever talk about it." Brett's response is a telling one: "How can I help it?" (249). Just as she had earlier been helpless to prevent his leaving her, Brett cannot help talking about Romero.

Brett's two references to Mike Campbell, the man she deserted in Pamplona to run off with Romero, make sense only if Romero left Brett, rather

than the other way around. In the throes of disappointment after telling Jake that Romero "wanted to marry me, finally," Brett says, "I can't even marry Mike" (*SAR* 246). The key word here is *even*, reflecting Brett's sense that Mike isn't much but she doesn't deserve even that. Brett's second reference to Mike signals her loss of self-worth yet more sharply. The draft manuscript version reads this way:

> "I'm going back to Mike," I could feel her crying as I held her close.
>
> "He's so damned nice and he's so very awful. He's my sort." (*SAR: Facsimile* 603)

Hemingway revised the final sentence by adding two key words: "He's my sort of thing" (*SAR* 247). In calling Mike, and by extension herself, a "thing," Brett reveals—as Debra Moddelmog points out—"her inner turmoil and ambivalence" (158).

But Brett's comment also registers the depth of her self-loathing brought on by Romero's rejection. Mike had earlier referred to Brett as a "thing" (*SAR* 85), but had done so light-heartedly, evoking a smile from Brett. By contrast, her use of the term echoes Romero's disdainful view of the bullfighter Marcial as "the sort of thing he knew all about" (219), as something beneath notice or regard. Hemingway uses the word "thing" in an equally insulting way in both "The Mother of a Queen" where the reprehensible bullfighter Paco, whose mother's body is dumped into a bone heap because he refuses to pay for her grave, is labeled a "thing" (*CSS* 318) and in "A Clean, Well-Lighted Place" where the insensitive younger waiter says that "An old man is a nasty thing" (*CSS* 289). By likening herself to a "thing," Brett powerfully reveals her self-contempt.

Brett's self-loathing is an additional indication that she has not behaved virtuously in Madrid, especially when her words are understood in the context of the novel's definition of morality. In Chapter XIV, the novel's expository and thematic center, Jake defines "immorality" as "things that made you disgusted afterward" (*SAR* 152); by implication, then, morality consists of things that make you feel good afterwards.[4] *Death in the Afternoon*, Hemingway's first-person treatise on bull-fighting published just six years after *The Sun Also Rises*, makes it clear that Jake's standards are his creator's as well: "So far, about morals, I know only that what is moral is what you feel good after and what is immoral is what you feel bad after. . ."

(*DIA* 4). Because Brett feels bad after Romero has left—as her crying, trembling, repeating herself, looking away, losing control, and calling herself a "thing" demonstrate conclusively—she has not acted morally by Jake's or Hemingway's standards. If Brett had indeed sent Romero away, if she had "realized . . . . right away" that he "shouldn't be living with any one" (*SAR* 245), if she had performed the act of "virtuous renunciation" that Earl Rovit and other critics ascribe to her, then she should genuinely be feeling "all right" and "rather good" and "rather set up" (246–247). But she doesn't. She feels rotten because she knows that Romero walked out on her, and she has no reason for self-congratulation.

One further sign of Brett's depressed emotional state is the complete absence, in Book III, of her wonderful humor and what Lorie Watkins Fulton calls her "subtle wit" (68). In Book I, in Paris, Brett had joked with Jake about his bringing a prostitute to the *bal musette* as being "in restraint of trade" (*SAR* 30) and with Count Mippipopolous about her career (68). In Book II, she tells Mike not to be "indecent" because there are "ladies at this bar" (85), humorously implying that she is not one. Even in Pamplona Brett jokes about having "the wrong type of face" (212) for church and about Romero's green trousers. But in Book III, in Madrid, Brett never attempts a joke and never exercises her wit. Instead, she is too depressed even to appreciate Jake's humor and irony. So when Jake speculates that Romero wanted to marry Brett in order to become "Lord Ashley," Brett doesn't catch the joke. She responds not with a laugh or a smile but only, more seriously, with "No. It wasn't that" (246).

Brett's mood lightens a bit when Jake takes her away from the room she had shared with Romero to the bar of the Palace Hotel, although even here Brett cannot stop talking about the bullfighter. Once again—actually for the fifth time—she acknowledges her powerlessness in relation to Romero: "How can I help it?" she asks Jake (*SAR* 249). Brett attempts to buoy her fallen spirits by convincing herself that she deserves credit "for deciding not to be a bitch" (249), but because it was Romero who left her, she has made no such decision at all.

During the final scenes of the novel—first at Botín's restaurant and then in a Madrid taxi—Romero is an invisible presence for both Jake and Brett. Mark Spilka is absolutely right in asserting that Romero "dominates the final conversation between the lovers, and so dominates the closing section" (*SAR* 256). For Jake, Romero is an unseen but powerful mentor guiding Jake's conduct toward Brett, the bull in his life.[5] For Brett, Romero

is present in several manifestations. At Botín's, Brett projects onto Jake the enduring love and commitment that she sought from Romero but did not receive. Brett thinks Jake is purposely getting drunk—four times she tells him, "Don't get drunk" (250)—because she believes that, in contrast to the departed Romero, Jake truly loves her and still pines for her. While Jake still cares for Brett as a friend—that is why he rescues her in Madrid and, knowing "she can't go anywhere alone" (107), arranges "for berths on the Sud Express for the night" (247)— he no longer harbors romantic fantasies about their *marrying* or living together. Brett, it becomes increasingly clear, is completely unaware of Jake's change.

Consumed by rejection and self-centered as always, Brett tells Jake detail after detail about Romero[6]—his age, his date of birth, his schooling, his learning English, his women. In her hotel room and through three Martinis at the Palace she never once inquires about the fiancé she abandoned in Pamplona or asks Jake a single question about himself. Not until they've completed a full meal at Botín's does Brett ask Jake a personal question and even then it is a superficial one: "'How do you feel, Jake?' Brett asked. 'My God! what a meal you've eaten'" (*SAR* 249).[7] Thus when Brett tells Jake, "You don't have to [get drunk]" and goes on to assure him, "You'll be all right" (249), she is uttering platitudes and clichés.

Brett knows nothing, for instance, of Jake's recuperation and self-restoration in San Sebastian.[8] A key implication of Brett's sending telegrams to Paris and Pamplona when Jake is actually in San Sebastian is that Brett does not know where Jake has been—literally or metaphorically. Brett's telegraphing Jake in Paris with the request that he meet her in Madrid underscores both her desperation and her dependence upon Jake: the train ride from Paris to Madrid would have taken Jake a full 28 hours.[9] So although it's true that Jake is—and will be—"all right," Brett has no means of knowing it. That's why Jake challenges her with the question, "How do you know?" (*SAR* 249). In Madrid, Jake is not what Brett had expected. He is not the loving, doting, and accepting romantic that he used to be and that Romero proved not to be. He is not the Romero substitute Brett desires.

Brett herself has not changed appreciably. As Michael Reynolds observes, Brett in Madrid "is no different than she is when we first meet her" (23). Brett "never ate much," and so even at "one of the best restaurants in the world" like Botín's, "Brett did not eat much" (*SAR* 249), a detail that links her to the sick and defeated Belmonte who "ate very little" (225) and distances her from the happy, self-assured Count Mip-

pipopolous, whose motto is "I always like a good meal" (64). Brett's last spoken words make clear that she is the same Brett who, earlier on the dance floor at Zelli's in Paris, had told Jake, "Oh, darling. . . , I'm so miserable" (70). Brett's final statement, spoken as she and Jake ride in a taxi along Madrid's Gran Via, both echoes her earlier expression of what Kenneth Lynn calls her "unquenchable unhappiness" (325) and constitutes her final—this time subtle—reference to Romero: "Oh, Jake," Brett said, "we could have had such a damned good time together." (*SAR* 251)

Brett feels sorry for herself because Romero has left her, and so for the first and only time in the novel she permits herself to indulge in the might-have-been with Jake Barnes. But Romero has not left Jake, who will have none of Brett's self-pity.[10] By responding "Isn't it pretty to think so?" Jake once and for all dismisses Brett's fantasies as foolishly sentimental (*SAR* 251). Brett will be surprised and pained by Jake's refusal to share her fantasy, but because Romero has "wiped out that damned Cohn" (246), she is free to return to Michael who, like Brett herself, is both awful and nice. Like Romero, who literally pays the bill at the Hotel Montana, Jake literally—as well as metaphorically—pays his bill for having Brett as a friend by purchasing them tickets on the Sud Express.[11] Brett herself doesn't "have a sou to go away" with (246). The train will take her back to San Sebastian, where Mike is waiting at a pub in nearby Saint Jean de Luz.[12] Thanks to Jake's friendship—and money—Brett is no longer "rather in trouble."

Because it was Romero's decision to end their relationship, Brett cannot be credited with what Kurt Krueger has called a "self-transcendent deed" (343) and Doris Helbig an act of "charity or agape" (103). Nor has she achieved the "moral triumph" (25) that Spilka attributes to her. Lady Ashley at the end of the novel is the same complex, interesting, charming, self-centered, and frustrated woman she has been all along. As the novel draws to a close, she greets Jake in Madrid with "Darling! I've had such a hell of a time" (*SAR* 245), just as she greeted him in Paris at the novel's beginning with "Oh, darling, I've been so miserable" (32). But Jake is not the same. He has learned and grown. As H. R. Stoneback accurately notes, "One of the main thrusts of the novel is to differentiate between Jake's character and behavior and Brett's, to draw distinctions. . ." (292). The final and most important distinction is that while Brett, unable to hold onto Pedro Romero, is sorrowfully and reluctantly returning to Mike, Jake is—thanks to the same Pedro Romero—now leading his life "all the way up" (18) and beginning a new phase of that life without the burden of Lady Brett Ashley.

NOTES

1. All quotations from *The Sun Also Rises* are from the Scribner 2003 edition and are cited parenthetically in the text.
2. Although Benson labels it "two weeks of adultery" (40), Brett and Romero could have been living together no more than three full days. Mike says that Brett had left Pamplona and "gone off with the bull-fighter chap" on the last day of the fiesta (*SAR* 227). The next day—Day Two—Jake says good-bye to both Mike and Bill Gorton, spends the night in Bayonne, France, and hears nothing from Brett. The following day—Day Three—Jake crosses the border to San Sebastian, Spain, where he spends the night, again with no word from Brett. But at mid-morning the next day—Day Four—Jake receives two telegrams from Brett announcing that she is "rather in trouble" and asking him to come to the Hotel Montana in Madrid (242). By the next morning—Day Five—when Jake arrives at the Hotel Montana, Romero is gone, and Brett tells Jake that Romero "only left yesterday"—that is on Day Four (245). There is strong reason to believe that it was Romero's departure that prompted Brett to wire Jake with a call for help. In any case, Brett and Romero could have been together for no more than three full days.
3. Hemingway emphasizes the importance of control throughout *The Sun Also Rises*. In the opening chapter, Robert Cohn's lack of emotional control, in contrast to his physical prowess in the boxing ring, is suggested by the passive voice: he "was married by the first girl who was nice to him," his mother "settled an allowance on *him*," and he is later "taken in hand" by another woman who "led him quite a life" (*SAR* 13–15). In the closing chapter of Book II Hemingway presents Cohn's opposite, Pedro Romero, whose bullfighting is "so slow and so controlled" (221). The marked contrasts between Cohn and Romero invite the reader to explore issues of control in the book's concluding chapter, especially the Madrid sequence.
4. Hemingway's most serious and important utterances are often cloaked by humor or understatement. In Chapter XIV Jake announces his philosophy of life, what Rovit calls "the value center of the novel" (149): "Enjoying living was learning to get your money's worth and knowing when you had it." But then he immediately qualifies it with "It seemed like a fine philosophy. In five years, I thought, it will seem just as silly as all the other fine philosophies I've had" (*SAR* 152). By the same token, Jake undercuts his own definition of immorality—"things that made you disgusted afterward"—with humor: "What a lot of bilge I could think up at night" (152).
5. For informative discussions of Romero's impact upon Jake, see Donald Daiker ("Affirmative Conclusion"), Terrence Doody, Dewey Ganzel, and Allen Josephs.
6. Significantly, Brett says not one single word about Romero's bullfighting, supporting James Nagel's assertion that "her interest in Pedro is sexual, and not a case of admiration of his craft" ("Brett" 97). Lawrence Broer, by contrast, mistakenly asserts that "Brett. . . becomes seriously involved in the meaning of the bullfight. . ." (*Spanish Tragedy*, 53).
7. Jackson Benson rightly notes Brett's failure to acknowledge Jake "as a human being with emotions" except for a question and a request designed as "feelers toward confirming whether the old sentimental magic is still working on Jake. . . ." (40–41).
8. For insightful commentary on the significance of Jake's stay in San Sebastian, according to Svoboda "one of the most heavily revised sections of the novel" (40), see Steinke ("both the experience and his untroubled attentiveness to it are cleansing and exhilarating" [133]), E. Miller Budick ("His swim at San Sebastian is not just a ritual immersion. It is a vital confrontation with sexuality and with death" [330]), Ellen Andrews Knodt ("Jake is now ready for Brett's

telegram" [35]), and H. R. Stoneback ("Jake has been to the bottom over the Brett-Cohn affair, but now, eyes wide open, having no illusions, he has come out the other side of that 'dark shadow'. . ." [281]).

9. "We left Paris one morning and got off the train at Madrid the next noon," Hemingway reported in "Bull Fighting a Tragedy," a 1923 article for *The Toronto Star Weekly* (*BL* 79).

10. Benson writes that to Brett, "Jake is a valuable piece of property, a home base for self pity that she can return to until the loss of Romero, or whoever it might be, has lost its poignancy" (42). For the case that by the end of the novel Jake has dispensed with self-pity and is now fully in control of himself, Brett, and their relationship, see Daiker (2007), Rovit (147–162), and Carole Gottlieb Vopat ("With pity and irony, compassion and control, Jake breaks the circle. . ." [104]).

11. After Hemingway moved from Paris to Toronto in the late summer of 1923, he wrote to his father, "We made a mistake to come back here. But the only way to do with mistakes is to pay for them and get out of them as soon as possible" (*SL* 100). Jake Barnes follows the exact same course.

12. Hemingway's unfinished sequel to *The Sun Also Rises*, a nine-page afterword probably written the year after the novel's publication, shows Brett and Michael back together. Cataloged under the title "Jimmy the Bartender," the sketch depicts Jake Barnes at the Dingo Bar in Paris when Lady Brett walks in with Mike Campbell. Jake is not surprised. See Fleming.

WORKS CITED

Benson, Jackson J. *Hemingway: The Writer's Art of Self-Defense*. Minneapolis: U Minnesota P, 1969.

Brenner, Gerry. *Concealments in Hemingway's Works*. Columbus: Ohio State UP, 1983.

Broer, Lawrence R. *Hemingway's Spanish Tragedy*. University, AL: U Alabama P, 1973.

———. "Intertextual Approach to *The Sun Also Rises*." In *Teaching Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. Peter Hays. Moscow: U Idaho P, 2003. 127–146.

Budick, E. Miller. "*The Sun Also Rises*: Hemingway and the Art of Repetition." *University of Toronto Quarterly* 56:2 (1986/7): 319–331.

Cohen, Milton A. "Circe and Her Swine: Domination and Debasement in *The Sun Also Rises*." *Arizona Quarterly* 41:4 (1985): 293–305.

Daiker, Donald A. "The Affirmative Conclusion of *The Sun Also Rises*." 1974–75. In *Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. James Nagel. New York: G. K. Hall, 1995. 74–88.

———. "Jake Barnes as Teacher and Learner: The Pedagogy of *The Sun Also Rises*." *The Hemingway Review* 27:1 (Fall 2007): 74–88.

Doody, Terrence. "Hemingway's Style and Jake's Narration." 1974. In *Ernest Hemingway: Seven Decades of Criticism*. Ed. Linda Wagner Martin. East Lansing: Michigan State UP, 1998. 103–117.

Fleming, Robert E. "Second Thoughts: Hemingway's Postscript to *The Sun Also Rises*." In *Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. James Nagel. New York: G. K. Hall, 1995. 163–169.

Fulton, Lorie Watkins. "Reading Around Jake's Narration: Brett Ashley and *The Sun Also Rises*." *The Hemingway Review* 24:1 (Fall 2004): 61–80.

Ganzel, Dewey. "*Cabestro* and *Vaquilla*: The Symbolic Structure of *The Sun Also Rises*." *Sewanee Review* 76 (1968): 26–48.

Helbig, Doris A. "Confession, Charity, and Community in *The Sun Also Rises*." *South Atlantic Review* 58:2 (1993): 85–110.

Hemingway, Ernest. *By-Line: Ernest Hemingway*. Ed. William White. New York: Bantam, 1967.
———. *The Complete Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway: The Finca Vigía Edition*. New York: Scribner's, 1987.
———. *Death in the Afternoon*. New York: Scribner's, 1932.
———. *Ernest Hemingway: Selected Letters, 1917–1961*. Ed. Carlos Baker. New York: Scribner's, 1981.
———. "Jimmy the Bartender." Item 530. The Ernest Hemingway Collection. John F. Kennedy Library. Boston, MA. 1–2.
———. *The Sun Also Rises*. 1926. New York: Scribner, 2003.
———. *The Sun Also Rises: A Facsimile Edition*. Ed. Matthew J. Bruccoli. Detroit, MI: Archive of Literary Documents, 1990.
———. *The Torrents of Spring*. 1926. New York, Scribner's, 1987.
Hyman, Stanley Edgar. *Standards: A Chronicle of Books for Our Time*. New York: Horizon, 1966.
Josephs, Allen. "*Toreo*: The Moral Axis of *The Sun Also Rises*." *The Hemingway Review* 6.1 (Fall 1986): 88–99.
Kinnamon, Keneth. "Hemingway, the Corrida, and Spain." 1959. In *Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises: A Casebook*. Ed. Linda Wagner-Martin. Oxford: Oxford U P, 2002. 81–98.
Knodt, Ellen Andrews. "Diving Deep: Jake's Moment of Truth at San Sebastian." *The Hemingway Review* 17.1 (Fall 1997): 28–37.
Krueger, Kurt J. "A Logotherapeutic Approach to Teaching *The Sun Also Rises*." In *Teaching Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. Peter Hays. Moscow: U Idaho P, 2003. 325–352.
Lewis, Robert W. "Tristan or Jacob?" 1965. In *Brett Ashley: Major Literary Characters*. Ed. Harold Bloom. New York: Chelsea House, 1991. 63–75.
Lynn, Kenneth S. *Hemingway*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1987.
Miller, Linda Patterson. "Brett Ashley: The Beauty of It All." In *Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. James Nagel. New York: G. K. Hall, 1995. 170–184.
———. "In Love with Papa." In *Hemingway and Women: Female Critics and the Female Voice*. Eds. Lawrence Broer and Gloria Holland. Tuscaloosa: U Alabama P, 2002. 3–22.
Moddelmog, Debra A. "Contradictory Bodies in *The Sun Also Rises*." 1999. In *Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises: A Casebook*. Ed. Linda Wagner-Martin. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2002. 155–165.
———. "Brett and the Other Women in *The Sun Also Rises*." In *The Cambridge Companion to Hemingway*. Ed. Scott Donaldson. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996. 87–108.
Reynolds, Michael S. *The Sun Also Rises: A Novel of the Twenties*. Boston, MA: Twayne, 1988.
Rovit, Earl. *Ernest Hemingway*. New Haven, CT: Twayne, 1963.
Spilka, Mark. "The Death of Love in *The Sun Also Rises*." 1958. In *Ernest Hemingway: Critiques of Four Major Novels*. Ed. Carlos Baker. New York: Scribner's, 1962. 18–25.
Steinke, Jim. "Brett and Jake in Spain: Hemingway's Ending for *The Sun Also Rises*." *Spectrum* 27: 1–2 (1985): 131–141.
Stoneback, H. R. *Reading Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises: Glossary and Commentary*. Kent, OH: Kent State U P, 2007.
Svoboda, Frederic Joseph. *Hemingway and The Sun Also Rises: The Crafting of a Style*. Lawrence: U P of Kansas, 1983.
Vopat, Carole Gottlieb. "The End of *The Sun Also Rises*: A New Beginning." 1972. In *Brett Ashley: Major Literary Characters*. Ed. Harold Bloom. New York: Chelsea House, 1991. 96–104.
Wylder, Delbert E. "The Two Faces of Brett: The Role of the New Woman in *The Sun Also Rises*." 1980. In *Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises*. Ed. James Nagel. New York: G. K. Hall, 1995. 89–94.

is not ideal, but it is the best handled of the posthumous Hemingway books that Scribner has published." He offers a collation of 373 substantive differences between the 1964 and 2009 editions.

"'Unpopularity is the Least of My Worries':
Captain R.W. Bates and Lieutenant E.M. Hemingway"
Stephen Bates

Making use of unpublished diaries, correspondence, and official records from his service in France and Italy, this article discusses the World War I experiences of Captain Robert W. Bates, the commanding officer of Hemingway's ambulance unit.

"The Jungle Out There: Nick Adams Takes to the Road"
George Monteiro

"The Battler" and "The Light of the World" can be viewed as contributions to hobo-tramp literature. Evoking the work in this vein of Jack London, W. H. Davies, Josiah Flynt, and Glenn H. Mullin, these hard-edged stories delineate late adolescent encounters—out-in-the-real-world experiences—that stand in stark contrast to those invented by Fitzgerald in *This Side of Paradise*, a defining work of what Updike calls "collegiate romanticism," as well as those presented in Owen Johnson's high-jinks romps—*The Prodigious Hickey* (1908), *The Varmint* (1910), and *The Tennessee Shad* (1911)—the Lawrenceville prep-school stories so avidly read at the time.

"'Brett Couldn't Hold Him':
Lady Ashley, Pedro Romero, and the Madrid Sequence
of *The Sun Also Rises*"
Donald A. Daiker

This essay challenges consensus that Lady Brett Ashley ends the affair with Pedro Romero by sending the bullfighter away after several days with him in a Madrid hotel. In fact, Romero leaves Brett. Through Jake Barnes's

words and actions, as well as the inconsistencies of Brett's story, her desperate need for rescue, her acute depression, her lack of self-control, her self-contempt—especially in her references to her fiancé Mike Campbell—and finally her self-pity, Hemingway shows that Brett could not hold on to Romero's affection in Madrid any more than she could physically hold Romero down in Pamplona.

"Hemingway's Pragmatism: Truth, Utility, and Concrete Particulars in *A Farewell to Arms*"
Katie Owens-Murphy

Critics have often noted Hemingway's aversion to theory and abstraction and his penchant for the practical and the concrete, but Hemingway scholarship has yet to invoke the pragmatism of William James as an explanatory framework for these issues of meaning and truth, of abstract universals and concrete particulars. Because it privileges the latter over the former, Jamesian pragmatism is particularly useful for an understanding of *A Farewell to Arms*, helping to explain why Frederic's oblique first-person narration focuses primarily on physical sensations. Pragmatism's emphasis on utility also helps us to understand the lying and role-playing that complicate the romance between Frederic and Catherine Barkley. Finally, while pragmatism illuminates *A Farewell to Arms* in particular, it is an important interpretive framework for Hemingway's fiction in general.

"A Clash of Certainties, Old and New: *For Whom the Bell Tolls* and the Inner War of Ernest Hemingway"
Michael K. Solow

For decades, critics have argued over the politics and worldview in Hemingway's novel of the Spanish Civil War. By looking closely at the author's pre-war writings and his experience and writings during the war, as well as by performing a close reading of key passages, this essay attempts to illuminate the novel's ambiguities and dissonances, arguing that they can be traced to warring certainties within Hemingway that found expression in the work. By evolving beyond isolationism, partisanship, and disillusionment, Hemingway gained greater access to a Keatsian "negative capability," marking an enlarged perspective and greater maturity in his art.